


Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

...is a forum that encourages debate on a wide range of research findings, with the overall aim of promoting evidence-based policy and law-making within Northern Ireland





Progress in planning: regression in enforcement?

Stephen Mc Kay
Director of Planning Education
School of Planning, Architecture and
Civil Engineering
Queen's University, Belfast

Planning practice and the purpose of the enforcement system

- Remedy the effects of unauthorised and undesirable development
- Take legal action against those who flout planning legislation
- *Traditionally labelled the Cinderella of the Planning System*





Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Definition of development

Two strands:

- operational development**
- material change of use**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Key Contextual Matters

- The Town and Country Planning Act 1947:
- Discretion
- The 4 year rule...**one exception**
- The enforcement notice
- The Magistrates Court
- 1947-90...**recognition of the need to differentiate in the definition of development**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Issue 1: the Magistrates Court



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Case 1

2010 – Demolition of B1 listed building at Piney Ridge on Belfast's Malone Road



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Piney Ridge



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

The outcome

- Following a successful prosecution, the Magistrates' Court fined the offender £150 whilst the company of which he is director was fined £200.
- The Department did not include a condition to reinstate the building in the listed building enforcement notice.



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Case 2

- Harrymount House, Waringstown - listed dwelling was unlawfully demolished following the start of approved works to renovate the building.
- Successfully prosecuted and the overall total fine imposed by the court was £50000.



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

The outcome

- ...the highest ever issued in the jurisdiction and seen as a major breakthrough in terms of the planning prosecution being supported by the courts.
- **On appeal, however, the £15000 fine imposed on each of the two owners was reduced to £500 and the contractor's £20000 fine was reduced to £100.**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Does the problem prevail elsewhere?

- The literature suggests that it is perceived as a problem throughout GB, particularly in the context of built heritage.



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

What about in the south?

- A snapshot suggests that similar issues prevail...Dublin, Cork and Limerick
- whilst in Leitrim the quote was....
- “we’ve almost given up on prosecuting as the courts either let those who flagrantly flout the law off the hook or fail to impose a significant deterrent”



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

A paradigm shift since mid -2012?



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Case 3

- **March 2012**
- **£30,000 at Armagh Magistrates' Court for non-compliance with two Enforcement Notices.**
- **Unauthorised operational development (shop, diner, storage buildings) and unauthorised change of use of lands to vehicle sales.**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Case 4

- **6th June 2012**
- **A £20,000 fine imposed at Enniskillen Magistrates' Court for non compliance with a Planning Enforcement Notice which sought the demolition of an unauthorised dwelling in Lisbellaw.**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

The rationale for change

- ...new sentencing guidance issued to the Magistrates Court
- However...



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Continuation of perceived leniency?

- **May 21st 2012**
- **Listed building demolition**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Before



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

After



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Outcome

The offender pleaded guilty to the demolition of a Listed Building and was fined £5,000



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

- **Fines issued to major offenders still perceived to be a problem**
- **Early evidence suggests that generally the “Super Councils” are “putting enforcement on the back burner”**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

February 2014

- **England – major development**
- **a specialised planning court has been created within the High Court and appeals may in certain circumstances be able to proceed directly to the Supreme Court**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Issue 2



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Time limitation

- From **4 and 10** to **5 and 5**
- The sequence of events:
 - Response to Consultation for Reform (2009)
 - The Planning Bill (November 2010)
 - The Planning Act 2011
 - Commencement of Section 132 (almost immediate)



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Section 132

- “....(1) where there has been a breach of control consisting in the carrying out without permission of building, engineering, mining or other operations...no enforcement action may be taken after the end of 5 years.....(3)in the case of any other breach of planning control, no enforcement action may be taken after the end of the period of 5 years **beginning with the date of the breach**..”
- **So what?**



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Recent developments

- The then DCLG 2002/2006 – 15 years
- Richard Humphreys QC in the JPL
 - “20 years of the 10 year rule – time for reform”
-not a reduction to a 5 year immunity period but a doubling to 20!
- ...associated issues



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Concealment and time limitation

- Concealment of development has been a high profile issue in England



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

The Fidler Case



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

An enforcement notice...may be issued...

- *within the period of four years from the date of the breach.*
- Forbes stated...”in my view the inspector’s findings of fact make it abundantly clear that the erection of the straw bales was an integral – indeed essential part of the operation designed to deceive the LPA”



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Important

- It was accepted **at that time** that concealment does not in itself provide a legitimate basis for the council to succeed, **as hiding something does not take away the lawful rights that accrue due to the passage of time...BUT** subsequently!



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

The Beesley Case



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Change of use from a barn to a dwelling

- SoS CLG and another v Welwyn Hatfield Council
- Beesley's applied for a LDC
 - refused
 - allowed on appeal
 - reversed at High Court
 - High Court decision reversed on appeal
 - Supreme Court set aside the LDC



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Positive deception!

- The court 's opinion was that dismissing the case would damage confidence in the law
- “Parliament had not intended such an outcome...dishonesty must not be crowned with success” ...The Connor Principle
- ...hence Mr Fidler’s conduct was also subsequently deemed to be a case of deception



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

April 6th 2012

- The Localism Act 2011
- Local authorities are provided with a 6 month window in which to take action against “**concealed breaches of planning control**”



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

The provision

- The period commences from the date on which a breach is discovered “**regardless of whether that discovery was made after the usual immunity period**”...applied to mining back in 1947!



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Going Forward

- We are moving into a new era of planning where policy making and decision taking must be seen to be beyond reproach.
- Questions still exist around the development and commencement of immunity legislation.
- If the legitimacy of the planning system is to be maintained perhaps issues like these need to be revisited and, where appropriate, remedies developed.



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

...and as for Mr Fidler



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

Thank you



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)



Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

...is a forum that encourages debate on a wide range of research findings, with the overall aim of promoting evidence-based policy and law-making within Northern Ireland