Dr Dan Hull

The DCAL Creative Industries Framework and the Scottish Creative Industries Strategy

This paper presents a comparison between the draft DCAL Creative Industries Framework and the Scottish Creative Industries Strategy.
Key Points

- Creative Scotland was established in 2010, bringing together the former Scottish Screen and the Scottish Arts Council. In March 2011, the Scottish Government published its strategy for the creative industries.

- In December 2011, a draft *Collaborative Framework to Support the Creative Industries* was created by the Department of Culture, Arts and Leisure, which takes the lead on the creative industries for Northern Ireland.

- Scotland’s creative industries account for a higher proportion of registered businesses than in Northern Ireland, and creative employees produce £41,600 per head, compared with £23,774 per employee in Northern Ireland.

- The Northern Ireland document makes clear that it is not a strategy, and that an overarching collaborative framework has been preferred. Caution should therefore be exercised when drawing comparisons.

- Nevertheless, this research paper has attempted to draw broad comparisons between the approaches taken in the two documents, focusing on six areas: the nature of policy interventions, interaction with Europe, use of external networks, the degree of business support and skills development, the nature of internal networks, strategic planning, and next steps.

- Differences of approach evidenced by the two documents suggest a number of points:
  - It could be argued that the policy infrastructure for the creative industries in Scotland is already more developed, allowing for more specific and detailed references in their strategy.
  - Interaction with wider networks, such as with European and UK institutions, is more specifically defined, and arguably more ambitious. There is comparatively little reference made in the Northern Ireland document of themes such as north-south and east-west collaboration.
  - The nature of business support in Scotland is more specifically geared towards the creative industries, rather than relying on generic models and bodies for advice and financing. Greater use is made of the sector skills councils for enhancing skills and launching apprenticeships.
  - Internal collaboration within Scotland is defined very specifically, with a collaborative agreement signed by each of the relevant bodies in 2009.
  - References are made in the Scottish document to sector-specific reports being commissioned. Similar research is described in the Northern Ireland framework, though with less detail about the range or intentions of such analysis.
  - The next steps are defined in greater detail in the Scottish strategy, and contain a greater number of commitments.
  - Neither document presents a detailed budget or timeline.
Executive Summary

Creative Scotland was established in 2010, bringing together the former Scottish Screen and the Scottish Arts Council. In March 2011, *Growth, Talent, Ambition: The Government’s strategy for the creative industries* was published.

In December 2011, a draft *Collaborative Framework to Support the Creative Industries* was created.

Scotland’s creative industries accounted for 63,000 employee jobs in Scotland in 2008. In 2010, there were 9,010 registered businesses in Scotland, or around 6% of all businesses. In 2007, GVA for the creative industries in Scotland was £2.4 billion in that year. This equates to £41,600 per employee.

In Northern Ireland, there were 31,000 people in creative employment in 2009. There were 2,200 business units in Northern Ireland in 2010, or 3.2% of the total. In 2008, GVA for the creative industries was £737 million. This equates to £23,774 per employee.

The Northern Ireland document makes clear that it is not a strategy, and that an overarching collaborative framework has been preferred, with more specific strategies to be worked up for each sub-sector.

There are some areas of similarity between the two documents. Both the NI framework and the Scottish strategy draw attention to the fact that the creative industries have been shown to be an effective stimulant to the economy as a whole, and both identify the fragmented nature of the creative industries sector to be a barrier to development.

This paper focuses on six areas of comparison between the two documents:

**Policy interventions**: it could be argued that Scotland has a more developed policy infrastructure for a creative industries strategy to drawn on. Their strategy contains a number of examples of such policies.

**Interaction with Europe**: the Scottish strategy identifies specific strands of European funding and projects which will be exploited. In the Northern Ireland document, developments at European level are referred to in broad terms only.

**External networks**: the Scottish strategy specifies a number of areas where the Scottish Government will seek to influence the UK Government. There are also a number of other UK-wide strategic links specified, such as the Technology Strategy Board and the National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts. The issue of enabling the international development of Scotland’s creative industries are also addressed.

**Business support and skills development**: The Scottish strategy acknowledges the business and financial challenges, and goes on to present in greater detail models of
financial support (such as incentive and development finance) than are evident in the Northern Ireland framework. The implication may be that business support will continue to be provided via generic mechanisms in Northern Ireland, rather than in a bespoke fashion designed specifically for the needs of the creative industries. Specific mention of the sector skills councils and the Sector Skills Agreements are made in the Scottish document, but not the Northern Ireland framework.

**Internal networks:****Fundamental to the approach taken by both documents is the definition of a collaborative structure, so that policy interventions and collaboration can be achieved. In doing this, both approaches build on existing structures and previous policy work. In Scotland, the responsibilities of different public sector agencies are set out in the Creative Industries Framework Agreement published in 2009, and the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership Report published in the same year. In Northern Ireland, previously a Creative Industries Working Group existed and it is proposed that this be replaced by a new structure consisting of two groups: a Creative Industries Advisory Group and a Creative Industries Government Collaboration Group. This approach does not specify precisely what role is to be played in the collaborative network by bodies such as the Arts Council of Northern Ireland or Northern Ireland Screen.

**Strategic planning:** A clear process is defined in the Scottish strategy whereby reports are requested from each industry reference group, recommendations are made, and then SCIP ‘will develop detailed actions to address the recommendations’. The Scottish strategy sets out goals, priority objectives for the sector, specific barriers to be overcome and recommendations in each area. In the Northern Ireland framework, a process is also set out for intelligence to be gathered, through the Subsector Action Teams. These teams will provide industry insight and analysis by gathering intelligence about the workings and challenges of each industry. However, it is not clear whether research agenda or funding have been identified for such exercises, and whether a consistent assessment template is to be applied across all sub-sectors.

**Next steps:** Both documents contain final sections which set out the next steps in achieving the objectives set out by the strategy/framework. While the Scottish strategy sets out a process by which each of the sub-sector reference groups is expected to return reports to the SCIP Coordination Group and specific commitments are set out in the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership Agreement, the final section of the Northern Ireland framework sets out in briefer terms four initiatives: Creativity Month, consideration of a Creativity Council, and working with the Culture Company 2013 to both enhance Derry-Londonderry 2013 and set up ‘a digital platform to promote creativity’.
## Contents

Key Points .......................................................................................................................... 1
Executive Summary .............................................................................................................. 3
Contents .............................................................................................................................. 5

1 Creative Scotland .............................................................................................................. 7

2 The Scottish Government’s Strategy for the Creative Industries ............................. 8

3 DCAL’s Creative Industries Framework ......................................................................... 9

4 Comparisons .................................................................................................................... 10
   4.1 Policy interventions ......................................................................................................... 11
   4.2 Interaction with Europe .................................................................................................. 11
   4.3 External networks .......................................................................................................... 12
   4.4 Business support and skills development ..................................................................... 12
   4.5 Internal networks .......................................................................................................... 14
   4.6 Strategic planning .......................................................................................................... 15
   4.7 Next steps ..................................................................................................................... 15
1 Creative Scotland

Creative Scotland was created through the Public Services Reform (Scotland) Act 2010, and is an amalgamation of the Scottish Arts Council and Scottish Screen. It has been stated that this merger saved around £720,000 in 2010/11. Creative Scotland was launched on 1 July 2010. Its remit is to be the national leader for Scotland’s arts, screen and creative industries. The legislation sets out the role of Creative Scotland as follows:

a) identifying, supporting and developing quality and excellence in the arts and culture from those engaged in artistic and other creative endeavours,
b) promoting understanding, appreciation and enjoyment of the arts and culture,
c) encouraging as many people as possible to access and participate in the arts and culture,
d) realising, as far as reasonably practicable to do so, the value and benefits (in particular, the national and international value and benefits) of the arts and culture,
e) encouraging and supporting artistic and other creative endeavours which contribute to an understanding of Scotland's national culture in its broad sense as a way of life,
f) promoting and supporting industries and other commercial activity the primary focus of which is the application of creative skills.

Further information is provided in the organisation’s Corporate Plan 2011–2014. This highlights parallel and subsequent developments regarding the creative industries sector. A Creative Industries Framework Agreement was published in 2009 setting out the relative responsibilities of Creative Scotland, Scottish Enterprise, Highlands and Islands Enterprise and Scottish Local Government. This was then followed by a Creative Industries Partnership Report, and the establishment of a Scottish Creative Industries Partnership. The Scottish Government created a strategy for the creative industries in March 2011, placing a strong emphasis on monitoring, reporting and oversight through a Scottish Creative Industries Partnership. Creative Scotland acts as the chair of this partnership.

As part of the work flowing from this strategy, a number of sector reviews are being conducted, with the dance sector, music sector, and visual arts and crafts review currently live. Each study is intended to provide an overview of the state of each sector and provide the basis ‘for a more strategic approach to investment and commissioning’.

---

3 Creative Scotland. ‘Sector reviews’: http://www.creativescotland.com/about/sector-reviews Page consulted on 1.6.12.
2 Scottish Government’s *Strategy for the Creative Industries*

The Scottish Government published a strategy for the creative industries in March 2011\(^4\). This followed reviews of both the sector and its challenges\(^5\), and of key statistics and literature\(^6\), in 2009. This new strategy is intended to outline:

\[\ldots\text{what the Government is already doing to create the environment to ensure that the creative industries are able to flourish, and sets out our programme for action}\] \(^7\).

In doing so, it attempts to address the following issues:

- **Establishing and improving structures** so that the public sector is as supportive as possible of those working in the creative industries. The key, central body is the Scotland’s Creative Industries Partnership (SCIP);
- **Ensuring that the right interface and monitoring groups** are in place, including the establishment of industry practitioner reference groups, each reporting back to a SCIP Coordination Group on what the specific challenges of each sub-sector are and proposed solutions to increase growth;
- **A set of recommendations** is set out, with recognition of the specific barriers which must be confronted in order for each to be implemented. The **key challenges** are identified as a lack of joined up approach; a lack of scale across much of the sector with small and micro enterprises predominating; intense competition in international markets; the difficulties of securing finance and investment; the need for constant ‘re-skilling’ and ‘up-skilling’ of workforces particularly in the light of rapidly changing technology; the need for improved, reliable market intelligence; and the need also for consistent approaches to the measuring of economic value and impact.

The strategy summarises the recent economic performance of Scotland’s creative industries. The sector accounted for 63,000 employee jobs in Scotland in 2008\(^8\), equating to around 15.5% of total employment\(^9\). In 2010, there were 9,010 registered businesses in Scotland, or around 6% of all businesses. In 2007, GVA for the creative industries in Scotland was £2.4 billion in that year. This equates to £41,600 per employee\(^10\).

This compares with 31,000 people in creative employment in 2009, or 4.1% of total employment\(^\text{11}\). There were 2,200 business units in Northern Ireland in 2010, or 3.2% of the total. In 2008, GVA for the creative industries was £737 million\(^\text{12}\). This equates to £23,774 per employee.

3 **DCAL’s Creative Industries Framework**

A *Collaborative Framework to Support the Creative Industries* was published in draft form in December 2011. Previous documents have included *Unlocking Creativity: a creative region*, a document which outlined a three year action plan for Northern Ireland, including 51 action points to be taken forward by departments and others up to March 2007. This was followed by a *Strategic Action Plan for the Creative Industries*, launched to coincide with the Creative Industries Innovation Fund in 2008. This set out a review of creative industries policy over the preceding decade, before presenting a strategic action plan for the creative industries described as ‘interim’. The plan had the following intention:

> The intention in developing the interim SAP was not to provide a prescriptive or rigid framework for creative industries policies in Northern Ireland, but rather to provide a flexible basis for the development and evolution of support actions for the creative industries sector\(^\text{13}\).

The new, draft *Collaborative Framework* formed in 2011 sets out ‘a framework to stimulate and nurture collaboration in support of the creative industries’. The intention is to do this by defining ‘structures, roles and principles guiding strategic collaborations and investment across the creative industries’\(^\text{14}\). The framework seeks to achieve the following objectives:

- **A definition of the creative industries and brief figures** regarding its recent economic performance, and a brief assessment of his further potential.
- It then goes on to set out a **vision** and a **set of guiding principles**. The vision of the framework is defined as: ‘Establish and sustain a creative industries pipeline from which creative people, creative ideas and creative businesses emerge and flourish’\(^\text{15}\).
- **Key barriers** are identified, including a fragmented industry with insufficient scale and engagement with international markets.
- A key focus of the framework document is the ‘**Triple Helix approach**’, defined here as collaboration between industry, government and academia.
- The framework also sets out ‘**a way forward**’ at the end of the document.

\(^\text{15}\) DCAL. *A Collaborative Framework*: p10.
The document makes clear that it is not a strategy, and that strategic priorities are instead provided by the NI Executive Economic Strategy. Section one provides an explanation as to why a ‘framework’ has been preferred:

An over-arching creative industries strategy document, at this time, would not necessarily provide the means to tackle this fragmentation or sufficiently address the needs of specific sub-sectors. The creative industries are known for ‘their ability to shape or amplify social and cultural trends.’ Therefore a responsive and adaptive ability to support individual sub-sectors and the sector as a whole is vital.

For example, a creative industries strategy document published as recently as 2010 would not have incorporated the impact of products such as the iPad on consumer trends and the distribution of creative content. This is particularly relevant as 70% of the value and most of the growth potential of the creative industries sector lies in the content and advertising space.

Strategies, it is implied, are a matter for the sub-sectoral:

The challenge is therefore to put in place a means to implement effective approaches and sub-sector strategies that grow and develop the creative industries while contributing to regional economic goals and priorities.

Instead, a broader, framework approach is presented in order to address ‘structural deficiencies in the relationships and interaction’ between industry, academia and government.

4 Comparisons

In general terms, the documents take a different form and would seem to have markedly different intentions. While the Scottish document is certainly a ‘strategy’, setting out in detailed terms the actions to be taken in the years ahead and closely assigning responsibilities, the Northern Ireland document is an overarching ‘framework’. The draft framework is somewhat shorter, and ‘defines structures, roles and principles guiding strategic collaborations and investment across the creative industries’.

Nevertheless, there are some areas of similarity between the two documents. For example, both the NI framework and the Scottish strategy draw attention to the fact that the creative industries have been shown to be an effective stimulant to the economy as a whole. Both documents also focus on the need for a strong structure of support and

17 European Commission. 2010. Unlocking the potential of the cultural and creative industries.
20 DCAL. A Collaborative Framework: p5.
Furthermore, both documents identify the fragmented nature of the creative industries sector to be a barrier to development.

4.1 Policy interventions

It could perhaps be argued that at the present time Scotland has a more developed policy infrastructure for a creative industries strategy to drawn on, and that it follows that the Scottish strategy contains more detailed proposals.

For example, the Scottish strategy describes an ‘innovation voucher scheme’, which is a specific scheme used to support collaboration between SMEs and further and higher education.

Specific discussions are contained within the Scottish strategy about the role of the curriculum, and especially the relationship between culture, creativity and the curriculum. An *Education and the Arts, Culture and Creativity Action Plan* has been formed and is being implemented by Creative Scotland and Learning Teaching Scotland. A further example of a complementary policy is the launch of *Scotland’s Digital Future: A Strategy for Scotland* was launched, launched in March 2011.

4.2 Interaction with Europe

In the Scottish strategy, specific strands of European funding, whether current or forthcoming, are described with an intention that ‘Scotland’s public sector will seek to increase European funding applications’. For example, projects forming part of the European Regional Development Fund, INTERREG IVA Fund, and other opportunities offered by the three relevant EU directorates with responsibility for aspects of the creative industries are detailed. Scotland is also involved in a European funded project, Creative Growth, which will include groups looking at issues such as access to finance and business networks. Both Creative Scotland and the Scottish Government submitted responses to the consultation on a European Green Paper on Culture and Creativity.

In the Northern Ireland document, developments at European level are referred to on three occasions: with regard to the EU definition of smart specialisation, in relation to the EU Green Paper on cultural and creative industries, and a general reference to working with ‘partners across Europe’.

---

4.3 External networks

The Scottish strategy specifies areas, such as tax incentives, where the Scottish Government will seek to influence the UK Government. Indeed, there is a dedicated section within the strategy on relations with the UK government regarding the creative industries. There are also UK-wide strategic links specified in the form of the Technology Strategy Board’s (TSB) ‘Creative Industries Knowledge Transfer Network’. It is not clear to what extent DCAL is a participant in this network. TSB also has a creative industries strategy for the UK.

Work with the UK-wide body National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts (NESTA) is referred to in the Scottish strategy, with specific examples of policy pilots and funding opportunities provided.

There are references in the Scottish strategy specifically to the issue of supporting businesses in their efforts to build links with international markets. For example, Scottish Development International (SDI) works closely with the GlobalScot network to provide contacts for Scottish creative industries companies. Scottish Development International in turn works in partnership with UK Trade International (UKTI). It is not clear the extent to which Northern Ireland creative companies are able, or encouraged, to work with UKTI, though Invest NI supports businesses in building international links. One of the specific benefits of such a link highlighted by the Scottish strategy is use of the Overseas Market Introduction Service, as well as access to trade missions and trade fairs.

4.4 Business support and skills development

The Scottish strategy acknowledges the business and financial challenges, and goes on to present in further detail models of financial support (such as incentive and development finance) than in the Northern Ireland framework. For example, there is an acknowledgement of the barriers in assessing finance, but also specific details of the kinds of investment options which may be made available and which sub-sectors may benefit from such measures in particular. It is stated that the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership is currently mapping the different types of financial support available across the public sector.
There is a clear recognition in the Scottish strategy that creative businesses may not be compatible with standard enterprise agency models. For example, Highlands and Islands Enterprise (HIE) has appointed, in collaboration with Creative Scotland, a development manager specifically to support the creative industries sector. A Business Mentoring Scotland Programme is delivered through a partnership between the Scottish Chambers of Commerce, HIE and Scottish Enterprise with 600 mentors across Scotland. However, it is suggested in the strategy that a new initiative may be required targeting such mentoring specifically at creative entrepreneurs40.

Some specific policy initiatives are described aimed at product development in the creative industries and business support.

In the Northern Ireland framework, the issue of business support is not addressed in detail. It is stated that ‘involvement of industry sectoral groups and representative bodies will harness established industry networks and maximise practitioner engagement’41.

The implication may be that business support will continue to be provided via generic mechanisms in Northern Ireland42, rather than in a bespoke fashion designed specifically for the creative industries.

Specific mention of the sector skills councils and the Sector Skills Agreements. The sector skills councils are able to deliver sectoral labour market intelligence as well as qualitative information on the skills demands of each specific sector. A sector skills action plan has been presented by Skills Development Scotland (SDS) to the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership (SCIP). A number of policy initiatives have been commenced by SDS in response to identified needs. These include examples such as the following43:

- Funding for 50 Creative Apprenticeships;
- Investing in a Drama Training Programme, in collaboration with BBC Scotland;
- Launch of a Flexible Training Opportunities fund, offering up to £500 per employee for companies with fewer than 50 people (this can include freelancers);
- Supporting Moray Firth Media Trust to deliver work-place training for radio producers and broadcasters.

In the Northern Ireland framework, the sector skills councils do not appear to be included. The theme of skills is mentioned, though it is stated that DE and DEL will be taking the lead, with improved links created with further and higher education.

---

42 DCAL. *A Collaborative Framework*: p5.
4.5 Internal networks

Fundamental to the approach taken by both documents is the definition of a collaborative structure, so that policy interventions and collaboration can be achieved. In doing this, both approaches build on existing structures and previous policy work. In Scotland, the responsibilities of different public sector agencies are set out in the Creative Industries Framework Agreement published in 2009, and the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership Report published in the same year. The roles of both these key organisations, and some additional bodies, are then illustrated in further detail in the 2011 strategy. This provides examples of the role being played by such bodies as the National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts (NESTA), Skills Development Scotland, the Scottish Funding Council, Creative Scotland, and various key children’s and school organisations, particularly regarding their relationship to the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership (SCIP).

In Northern Ireland, previously a Creative Industries Working Group existed as an ‘advisory group convened by DCAL to advise it on the development of policies for the creative industries in Northern Ireland’, consisting of representatives from DCAL, Invest NI, DEL, the three Sector Skills Councils covering most of the creative industries, Northern Ireland Screen, the University of Ulster, Belfast City Council, CraftNI, and the Northern Ireland Music Industry Commission.

The new framework for Northern Ireland proposes a structure consisting of two groups: a Creative Industries Advisory Group and a Creative Industries Government Collaboration Group44. These two groups will be structured as follows:

- **Creative Industries Ministerial Advisory Group**
  - This group consists of industry representatives and HE/FE representatives, and will be jointly chaired by the DCAL Minister and the DETI Minister. It will include a set of sub-sector action teams, for example craft, digital content, music and design. Pre-existing sectoral representative groups will be used as secretariat bodies for each sector.

- **Creative Industries Government Collaboration Group**
  - This group involves DCAL, DETI, Invest NI, DE, DEL, and Local Government. Other bodies might assume membership at a later stage.

While the Scottish strategy states the role of key organisations and bodies with case studies illustrating the nature of their contribution to the creative industries, the Northern Ireland document adopts a somewhat broader approach, defining instead a collaborative framework, particularly between industry, government and academia, but with overall fewer bodies specifically referenced.

---

44 DCAL. A Collaborative Framework: p19: Support will be provided by Invest NI, DEL and DE.
This approach does not specify in clear terms what role is to be played in the collaborative network by bodies such as the Arts Council of Northern Ireland or Northern Ireland Screen. The structures outlined seek to link academia, government and industry, with a strong role allocated to Executive ministers through the Creative Industries Ministerial Advisory Group, and to departments through the Creative Industries Government Collaboration Group.

By contrast, the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership (SCIP) Co-ordination Group does not have direct government representation on it, though the Scottish Government has a standing invitation to attend meetings of the group.

4.6 Strategic planning

A clear process is defined in the Scottish strategy: reports are requested from each industry reference group, recommendations are made, and then SCIP ‘will develop detailed actions to address the recommendations’.

The Scottish strategy sets out goals, priority objectives for the sector, specific barriers to be overcome and recommendations in each area.

Market intelligence is already forthcoming for some sub-sectors and is being acted on\(^45\).

A recommendation is made that an economic impact study be conducted into the creative industries – thereby providing greater context than the standard GVA, employment and business statistics alone.

In the Northern Ireland framework, a process is also set out for intelligence to be gathered, through the Subsector Action Teams. These teams will provide industry insight and analysis by gathering intelligence about the workings and challenges of each industry. However, it is not clear whether research agenda or funding have been identified for such exercises, and whether a consistent assessment template to be applied across all sub-sectors will be created.

4.7 Next steps

Both documents contain final sections which set out the next steps in achieving the objectives set out by the strategy/framework.

The Scottish strategy sets out a process by which each of the sub-sector reference groups expected to return reports to the SCIP Coordination Group soon. Specific commitments by a number of the bodies which are members of SCIP, including Creative Scotland, the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, and Skills Development Scotland, are set out.

A set of commitments by each of the members of the Scottish Creative Industries Partnership is provided at the end of the strategy. For example, for the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities it is stated that it has responsibility for the Business Gateway. It is stated that the Scottish Funding Council will have joint responsibility for delivering the Creative and Cultural Sector Skills Action Plan, along with Skills Development Scotland.

The final section of the Northern Ireland framework sets out ‘a way forward’ which consists of a number of existing or potential policy initiatives. These include the following:

- Creativity Month, held annually each March.
- Working with the Culture Company 2013 to ‘enable an enhanced profile for both Creativity Month and the build-up to Derry-Londonderry City of Culture 2013’.
- Consideration will be given to a Creativity Council, to work closely with the Innovation Council.
- DCAL and the Culture Company will explore ‘a digital platform to promote creativity’.

---