Brexit and the Border
Managing the UK/Ireland Impact

Katy Hayward
With Milena Komarova & Michael Buttazzoni
School of Social Sciences, Education & Social Work
Queen’s University Belfast
KESS Seminar, 12 October 2016
Border Regimes: Concepts

- Governance
  - Laws, jurisdiction
  - Institutions

- Flows
  - ‘Four Freedoms’
  - Information
  - Interaction

- Citizenship
  - Rights (duties)
  - Inclusion/exclusion

- Security
  - Maintenance
  - Threat/challenge
Border Regimes: Layers

- European Union
  - Shared ‘external borders’
  - Supranational governance

- Common Travel Area
  - Different types of flows treated differently
  - Distinction from Schengen
  - British-Irish Agreement

- UK/Ireland differences

- All-island
  - North/South governance, cooperation
  - Symbolic and pragmatic

- Northern Ireland/GB differences
  - Devolution
  - Flows
  - Differences vis-à-vis citizenship
  - Security
National Identity %

Northern Ireland & Scotland, 2011 Censuses

- Other: NI = 4, Scotland = 5
- Irish only: NI = 1, Scotland = 25
- NI/Scottish only: NI = 6, Scotland = 21
- NI/Scottish and British: NI = 6, Scotland = 18
- British only: NI = 8, Scotland = 40

Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)
ELASTIC BREXIT?
BORDER SPECTRUM

Elasticity

Soft Border Regime

Governance
Flows
Citizenship
Security

Hard Border Regime

Governance
Flows
Citizenship
Security

Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)
Soft Brexit

- Governance
- Flows
- Citizenship
- Security

**Implications**

**Pros**
- Less (immediate) change to internal political divisions/alliances
- No major party in Northern Ireland wants to see the re-imposition of a hard border on the island
- Implications for trade north/south and east/west

**Cons**
- For pro-Brexit unionists: Strain due to continued compliance with EU law and the four freedoms?
- Less control over EU policymaking
- More interest in FDI going to Ireland?
Hard Brexit

- Governance
- Flows
- Citizenship
- Security

Implications

Pros
- Addresses primary EU-focused concerns of Leave voters
- Greater control over immigration
- Clean break, rewriting rules

Cons
- Most economic models predict that this will result in greatest trade destruction N/S
- Expected reduction in bilateral trade flows between NI and ROI
- Likely to cost the UK economy more than is gained from lower contributions to the EU budget;
- Stresses on the Union because of imposing overall will on the wishes of different constituent parts
Elastic Brexit:
Some Possibilities

**Special status for NI** agreed in negotiation with the EU and the UK (and Ireland?), such as:
- NI remains in EU but others leave
- Or UK remains (inc NI/Scotland) and England/Wales leave
- New status for NI as overseas territory
- New status for NI as member of the customs union.

**Reconfiguration of state of Ireland**
- Possibility of federation
- But Northern Ireland can only ‘choose’ Irish unification; other forms of association with Ireland would require British government approval
- Ireland could join Schengen Area.

**Differentiated treatment of different aspects of the four freedoms**
- Hard borders for people and soft for goods, capital, services
- Or gradients of ‘hardness’ for different groups of citizens (exists already to some extent), along lines of work permits and skills rather than nationality
- Or quotas.
Implications

Pros

- Secures future of the UK for medium term by giving recognition of different needs/interests of devolved regions
- Addresses cross-border concerns and particular needs of Irish border regime and border region

Cons

- Highly complex negotiations
- Complex institutional and constitutional redrawing
- Irish government will need to be incorporated as an interested party (mechanism for this?)
- Unionists wary of risks of further differentiation within the Union
Conclusions

• Priorities & Possibilities
Knowledge Exchange Seminar Series (KESS)

...is a forum that encourages debate on a wide range of research findings, with the overall aim of promoting evidence-based policy and law-making within Northern Ireland