

**From the Office of the  
Minister of Agriculture, Environment  
and Rural Affairs**



Christopher Stalford MLA  
Northern Ireland Assembly  
Parliament Buildings  
Ballymiscaw  
Stormont  
BT4 3XX

Room 438, Dundonald House  
Upper Newtownards Road  
Ballymiscaw  
Belfast BT4 3SB  
Telephone: 028 9052 4140  
Email: [private.office@daera-ni.gov.uk](mailto:private.office@daera-ni.gov.uk)

14 September 2021  
AQO 2407/17-22

**To ask the Minister of Agriculture, Environment and Rural Affairs to outline the scientific evidence informing the policy of culling badgers as a means of controlling Bovine Tuberculosis.**

My Department has carried out an extensive review of a wide and extensive range of scientific evidence in order to inform the proposed bTB Eradication strategy, a key component of which addresses the role played by badgers in the maintenance and spread of bovine TB.

The 2018 Godfray Bovine TB Strategy Review concluded that the presence of infected badgers poses a threat to local cattle herds, and noted that this conclusion reflected the broad consensus amongst epidemiologists who have studied the disease.

My Department therefore accepts that some form of wildlife intervention is necessary to break the cycle of infection transmission between the species. The key arguments and conclusions reached following consideration of this evidence are laid out in the consultation document and referenced in footnotes.



If you are deaf or have a hearing difficulty you can contact the Department via the Next Generation Text Relay Service by dialling 18001 + telephone number.



*Sustainability at the heart of a living, working, active landscape valued by everyone.*

A list of 31 of the scientific references sources considered by the Department in developing its wildlife intervention proposals is attached at Annex A.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Edwin Poots'.

**EDWIN POOTS MLA**  
**Minister of Agriculture, Environment and Rural Affairs**

## Annex A

Abdou, M., Frankena, K., O'Keeffe, J. and Byrne, A.W. (2016). Effect of culling and vaccination on bovine tuberculosis infection in a European badger (*Meles meles*) population by spatial simulation modelling. *Preventive Veterinary Medicine*, **125**, 19-30.

Aznar, I., Frankena, K., More S.J., O'Keeffe, J., McGrath, G., and de Jong, M.C. (2018). Quantification of *Mycobacterium bovis* in a badger field trial. *Preventative Veterinary Medicine*, **149**, 29-37.

Bielby, J., Donnelly, C.A., Pope, L.C., Burke, T. and Woodroffe, R. (2014). Badger responses to small-scale culling may compromise targeted control of bovine tuberculosis. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, **111**, 9193–9198.

Brunton, L.A., Donnelly, C.A., O'Connor, H., Prosser, A., Ashfield, S., Ashton, A., Upton, P., Mitchell, A., Goodchild, A.V., Parry, J.E. and Downs, S.H. (2017). Assessing the effects of the first 2 years of industry-led badger culling in England on the incidence of bovine tuberculosis in cattle in 2013-2015. *Ecology and Evolution*, **4**, 7213-7230. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ece3.3254>

Byrne, A.W., Kenny, K., Fogarty, U., O'Keeffe, J.J., More, S.J., McGrath, G., Teeling, M., Martin, S.W. and Dohoo, I.R. (2015). Spatial and temporal analyses of metrics of tuberculosis infection in badgers (*Meles meles*) from the Republic of Ireland: Trends in apparent prevalence. *Preventive Veterinary Medicine*, **122**, 345-354.

Carter, S.P., Chambers, M.A., Rushton, S.P., Shirley, M.D.F., Schuchert, P., Pietravalle, S., Murray, A., Rogers, F., Gettinby, G., Smith, G.C., Delahay, R.J., Hewinson, R.G. and McDonald, R.A. (2012). BCG vaccination reduces risk of tuberculosis infection in vaccinated badgers and unvaccinated badger cubs. *PLoS One*, **7**, e49833.

Chambers, M.A., Rogers, F., Delahay, R.J., Lesellier, S., Ashford, R., Dalley, D., Gowtage, S., Davé, D., Palmer, S., Brewer, J., Crawshaw, T., Clifton-Hadley, R., Carter, S., Cheeseman, C., Hanks, C., Murray, A., Palphramand, K., Pietravalle, S., Smith, G.C., Tomlinson, A., Walker, N.J., Wilson, G.J., Corner, L.A.L., Rushton, S.P., Shirley, M.D.F., Gettinby, G., McDonald, R.A. and Hewinson, R.G. (2011). Bacillus Calmette Guérin vaccination reduces the severity and progression of tuberculosis in badgers. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, **278**, 1913-1920.

Donnelly, C.A., Bento, A.I., Goodchild, A.V. and Downs, S.H. (2015). Exploration of the power of routine surveillance data to assess the impacts of industry-led badger culling on bovine tuberculosis incidence in cattle herds. *Veterinary Record*, **177**, 417-421.

Donnelly, C.A., Woodroffe, R., Cox, D.R., Bourne, F.J., Cheeseman, C.L., Clifton-Hadley, R.S., Wei, G., Gettinby, G., Gilks, P., Jenkins, H., Johnston, W.T., Le Fevre, A.M., McInerney, J.P. and Morrison, W.I. (2006). Positive and negative effects of widespread badger culling on tuberculosis in cattle. *Nature*, **439**, 843-846.

Feore, S.M. (1994). The Distribution and Abundance of the Badger *Meles meles* L. in Northern Ireland. PhD Thesis, Queen's University of Belfast. 285 pp.

Godfray, H.C.J., Donnelly, C.A., Hewinson, R.G., Winter, M. and Wood, J.L. (2018). Bovine TB strategy review: Report to Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State, Defra. October, 2018. Pp. 138.

Godfray, H.C.J., Donnelly, C.A., Kao, R.R., Macdonald, D.W., McDonald, R.A., Petrokofsky, G., Wood, J.L., Woodroffe, R., Young, D.B. and McLean, A.R. (2013). A restatement of the natural science evidence base relevant to the control of bovine tuberculosis in Great Britain. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, **280**, 1634.

Gormley, E., Ni' Bhuachalla, D., O'Keeffe, J., Murphy, D., Aldwell, F.E., Fitzsimons, T., Stanley, P., Tratalos, J.A., McGrath, G., Fogarty, N., Kenny, K., More, S.J., Messam, L.L. and Corner, L.A.L. (2017). Oral vaccination of free-living badgers (*Meles meles*) with Bacille Calmette Guérin (BCG) vaccine confers protection against tuberculosis. *PLoS One* **12**, e0168851.

Hardstaff, J.L., Bulling, M.T., Marion, G., Hutchings, M.R. and White, P.C.L. (2013). Modelling the impact of vaccination on tuberculosis in badgers. *Epidemiology and Infection*, **141**, 1417-1427.

Jenkins, H.E., Morrison, W.I., Cox, D.R., Donnelly, C.A., Johnston, W.T., Bourne, F.J., Clifton-Hadley, R.S., Gettinby, G., McInerney, J.P., Watkins, G.H. and Woodroffe, R. (2008). The prevalence, distribution and severity of detectable pathological lesions in badgers naturally infected with *Mycobacterium bovis*. *Epidemiology and Infection*, **136**, 1350-1361.

Jenkins, H.E., Woodroffe, R. and Donnelly, C.A. (2010). The duration of the effects of repeated widespread badger culling on cattle tuberculosis following the cessation of culling. *PLoS One*, **5**, e9090.

Jinks, R.C., et al. (2018). Evaluating sensitivity and specificity of the DPP test for TB in badgers using Bayesian methods. In preparation.

More, S.J. (2016a). The Bovine Tuberculosis Eradication Programme in Northern Ireland Proposals from the Tuberculosis Strategic Partnership Group (TBSPG) Scientific peer review: Final report. 13 September 2016. Pp. 71. <https://www.daera-ni.gov.uk/sites/default/files/publications/daera/peer-review-of-scientific-appraisal-by-simon-more-ucd.PDF>

More, S.J. (2016b). The Bovine Tuberculosis Eradication Programme in Northern Ireland Proposals from the Tuberculosis Strategic Partnership Group (TBSPG) Scientific peer review: Additional comments. 9 November 2016. Pp. 6. <https://www.daera-ni.gov.uk/sites/default/files/publications/daera/peer-review-of-scientific-appraisal-by-simon-more-additional-comments.PDF>

Murphy, D., Gormley, E., Collins, D.M., McGrath, G., Sovsic, E., Costello, E. & Corner, L.A.L. (2011). Tuberculosis in cattle herds are sentinels for *Mycobacterium bovis* infection in European badgers (*Meles meles*): the Irish Greenfield Study. *Veterinary Microbiology*, **151**, 120-125.

O'Keeffe, J. (2017). Replacing badger culling with vaccination in Ireland. Presentation at a one day bovine tuberculosis symposium held at Imperial College, London by the Save Me Trust (28 March 2017).

Reid, N., Etherington, T.R., Wilson, G.J., Montgomery, W.I. and McDonald, R.A. (2012). Monitoring and population estimation of the European badger *Meles meles* in Northern Ireland. *Wildlife Biology*, **18**, 46-57.

Sheridan, M. (2011). Progress in tuberculosis eradication in Ireland. *Veterinary Microbiology*, **151**, 160-169.

Smal, C. (1995). The badger and habitat survey of Ireland. In: Research Project Report Prepared for the National Parks and Wildlife Service and the Department of Agriculture, Food and Forestry, Government Publications Service, Dublin, 323 pp.

Smith, G.C., Budgey, R. and Delahay, R.J. (2013). A simulation model to support a study of test and vaccinate or remove (TVR) in Northern Ireland. AHVLA National Wildlife Management Centre report commissioned by DARD. Pp. 81. <https://www.daera-ni.gov.uk/sites/default/files/publications/dard/fera-tvr-modelling-report.pdf>

Smith, G.C. and Cheeseman, C.L. (2007). Efficacy of trapping during the initial proactive culls in the randomised badger culling trial. *Veterinary Record*, **160**, 723-726.

Smith, G.C., Cheeseman, C.L., Clifton-Hadley, R.S. and Wilkinson, D. (2001). A model of bovine tuberculosis in the badger, *Meles meles*: an evaluation of control strategies. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, **38**, 509-519.

Smith, G.C., Delahay, R.J., McDonald, R.A. and Budgey, R. (2016). Model of selective and non-selective management of badgers (*Meles meles*) to control bovine tuberculosis in badgers and cattle. *PLoS ONE*, **11 (Nov)**, e0167206.doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0167206.

TBSPG (2016). Bovine tuberculosis eradication strategy for Northern Ireland. Annex B. <https://www.daera-ni.gov.uk/sites/default/files/publications/daera/annex-b-to-scientific-appraisal-wildlife-and-vaccination-science-and-epidemiology-proposals-by-tbsp-g.pdf> . December 2016. Pp 50.

Wilkinson, D., Smith, G.C., Delahay, R.J. and Cheeseman, C.L. (2004). A model of bovine tuberculosis in the badger, *Meles meles*: an evaluation of different vaccination strategies. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, **41**, 492-501.

Woodroffe, R., Donnelly, C.A., Jenkins, H.E., Johnston, W.T., Cox, D.R., Bourne, F.J., Cheeseman, C.L., Delahay, R.J., Clifton-Hadley, R.S., Gettinby, G., Gilks, P., Hewinson, R.G., McInerney, J.P. and Morrison, W.I. (2006). Culling and cattle controls influence tuberculosis risk for badgers. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, **103**, 14713-14717.